| S.no | Clause Description  | Details of Item per Tender<br>Requirement   | Query/ Suggestion  | <u>Clarifications</u>   |
|------|---|---|--|---|
| I.   | Name of Firm: M/s Deloitte Touche To  | -   |  |   |
| 1)   | Section 7 Page No. 7 Stage-II (Short listing/Scoring criteria for empanelment of Financial Advisor) Evaluation Criteria 7.1.1 | The applicant should submit clients completion certificate for each assignment to support their claim along with firm's experience and team experience separately not more than 2 pages for specific assignments by the authorized person of the firm.  | In many cases client doesn't provide completion certificate. It is therefore requested to allow to submit other documentary evidence such as engagement letter, letter of award etc.   | Applicant can submit the empanelment letter. In case the order is awarded, the proof of completion certificate will be submitted. The applicant should submit the proof towards the receipt of full fees from their clients, in case they could not submit completion certificate for any task completed by them.  In case of non-disclosure agreement, self-certified declaration from MD/Competent Authority may be submitted. However, on selection, proof of the relevant document shall be provided. |
| 2)   | Section 7 Page No. 7 Stage-II (Short listing/Scoring criteria for empanelment of Financial Advisor) Evaluation Criteria 7.2.1 | The applicant should indicate the team with the team leader and the role and responsibility of each key member.  The applicant should indicate the details of FTE professionals along with supporting documents for their engagement and provide an organization structure of the applicant indicating the FTE professional in that category. | We would like to highlight that the FTE professionals working with us has wide range of industry experience. The experience of individuals may be from their earlier organizations.  As an Industry wide practice, self-certification from professional are allowed. Therefore, we request you to kindly allow self-certification of Individual. | Self Certification from professionals is also required in addition to other requirement.  |
| 3)   | Section 7 Page No. 7 Stage-II (Short listing / Scoring criteria for empanelment of Financial Advisor).                        | Key Personnel  The applicant should indicate the team key personnel with experience in  | The RFP seeks expertise in financial & legal aspects. We would like to highlight that legal practice is regulated by Bar council of India  | This clause is included to demonstrate that the Applicant possess necessary expertise in providing the legal assistance.  |

|    | 7.2.2                       | finance and legal fields/sectors.        | and typically, the Financial/         | Hence, the Applicant is required to |
|----|-----------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
|    |                             |  | Transaction advisory firms            | comply with this clause.            |
|    |                             |  | associate with registered legal       | 1 3                                 |
|    |                             |  | practitioners on case to case basis.  |                                     |
|    |                             |  | This also helps in providing the best |                                     |
|    |                             |  | legal expertise suited to the need of |                                     |
|    |                             |  | the project.                          |                                     |
|    |                             |  | Seeking legal expertise at this stage |                                     |
|    |                             |  | would necessitate exclusive           |                                     |
|    |                             |  | association for legal expertise and   |                                     |
|    |                             |  | might not be in the best interest of  |                                     |
|    |                             |  | IPA.                                  |                                     |
|    |                             |  | We request to kindly omit the legal   |                                     |
|    |                             |  | person requirement from RFP for       |                                     |
|    |                             |  | empanelment of Consultants and        |                                     |
|    |                             |  | same may be procured &                |                                     |
|    |                             |  | demonstrated by the empaneled         |                                     |
|    |                             |  | Transaction advisor on project to     |                                     |
|    |                             |  | project basis, prior to selection for |                                     |
|    |                             |  | respective projects.                  |                                     |
| 4) | Section 8                   | The Earnest Money shall be paid in the   | EMD of successful bidders/            | Tender conditions prevail.          |
|    | General Conditions          | form of Demand Draft (DD) issued by      | Empaneled bidders will be retained    |                                     |
|    | 8.15                        | a Nationalized Bank / Scheduled Bank     | for the entire period of              |                                     |
|    | Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) | drawn on New Delhi Branch of the         | empanelment i.e 3 years by IPA or     |                                     |
|    |                             | Bank in favour of the Indian Ports       | such extended period by IPA.          |                                     |
|    |                             | Association, New Delhi. The EMD          | We understand that EMD of all         |                                     |
|    |                             | must be forwarded in separate cover      | successful bidders will be kept for 3 |                                     |
|    |                             | (cover I) along with Tender. In case, it | years and it will be refunded after 3 |                                     |
|    |                             | is not forwarded as stated above, the    | years.                                |                                     |
|    |                             | tender will be liable to be rejected. No | Kindly confirm our understanding.     |                                     |
|    |                             | cash remittance along with the tender    | Also, it is suggested that EMD for    |                                     |
|    |                             | will be accepted. The amount of          | the purpose of empanelment may be     |                                     |
|    |                             | earnest money will be refunded to        | refunded and instead project          |                                     |
|    |                             | disqualified Tenderers/non Short listed  | specific EMD may be sought for        |                                     |
|    |                             | tenderers as soon as possible by IPA.    | each project under the                |                                     |

|     |   | No interest will be allowed on the       | empanelment.                         |                                     |
|-----|---|--|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
|     |   | earnest money from the date of receipt   |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | until it is refunded. EMD of successful  |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | bidders/Empaneled bidders will be        |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | retained for the entire period of        |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | empanelment i.e 3 years by IPA or        |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | such extended period by IPA.             |                                      |                                     |
| II. | Name of Firm: M/s LSI Financial Serv    |  |                                      |                                     |
| 1)  | Page no. 4 scope of work                | Kindly specify if 'Similar assignments'  |                                      | Multiple assignments will also be   |
|     | page no. 6 'Similar work'               | should include all the scope of work     |                                      | counted.                            |
|     |   | mentioned in a single assignment or      |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | may be fulfilled by multiple             |                                      |                                     |
|     |   | assignments.                             |                                      |                                     |
| 2)  | Page no. 4 of RFQ document, under brief | it specifies the scope as 'Assistance in | Please mention if Detailed Project   | Applicant is not expected to        |
|     | scope of work of Financial Advisor for  | preparation of project feasibility study | Report(DPR) would be provided to     | prepare the DPR                     |
|     | PPP projects                            | and bankable detailed project reports'   | the consultants for preparation of   |                                     |
|     | 1 3                                     | 1 3 1                                    | bankable DPR or the consultant       |                                     |
|     |   |  | needs to prepare DPR from the        |                                     |
|     |   |  | scratch                              |                                     |
| 3)  | Page no. 9 of RFQ document clause 8.15  |  | We suggest you to re-consider the    | Tender conditions prevail.          |
|     | for EMD                                 |  | amount of EMD and Document fee       | •                                   |
|     |   |  | , which appear to be high in view of |                                     |
|     |   |  | the RFQ is for Empanelment only.     |                                     |
| 4)  | Page no. 11 of RFQ document clause      |  | 70 pts has been allocated to         | This is meant for the RFP stage at  |
|     | 8.18 Evaluation Processes               |  | Key Personnel whereas in page        | Port.                               |
|     |   |  | no.7, it is mentioned that 40 pts    |                                     |
|     |   |  | being allocated for Company /        | Ports will invite RFP for proposed  |
|     |   |  | Consultancy Assignment               | project with Key personnel details  |
|     |   |  | Experience and 30 pts for Human      | along with Financial Bid, which     |
|     |   |  | Resources. Kindly clarify.           | will be evaluated as QCBS method    |
|     |   |  |                                      | (key personnel – 70 & financial     |
|     |   |  |                                      | bid -30) for that specific project. |
|     |   |  |                                      | old 30) for that specific project.  |
|     |   |  |                                      |                                     |

| III. | Name of Firm: M/s Crisil Risk & Infrastructure Solutions Ltd. |   |   |   |  |
|------|---|---|---|---|--|
| 1)   | Appendix 1  | Minimum Qualification for Finance Key Personnel: Either CA or ICWA or CFA or MBA (Finance) having 5 years' experience.  | We request the Authority to consider Post Graduate Diploma (Finance) and Master of Management Studies (Finance) as equivalent to MBA  | Tender conditions prevail.  |  |
| 2)   | 6.1   | Average annual turnover during the last 3 financial years ending with 31st March (2014, 2015 and 2016) should be at least Rs 100 Lakhs for empanelment  | We observe an accounting cycle with year ending on December 31st. Thus request you to accept, Average annual turnover during the last 3 financial years ending with 31st December (2013, 2014 and 2015) should be at least Rs 100 Lakhs for empanelment | Average annual turnover during the last 3 financial years (2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16) should be at least Rs 100 Lakhs for empanelment.   |  |
| 3)   | 7.1.1   | The applicant should submit clients completion certificate for each assignment to support their claim along with firm's experience and team experience separately in not more than 2 pages for specific assignments by the authorized person of the firm. | Request to consider the mandate letter in cases where completion certificate is not available.  | Applicant can submit the empanelment letter.  In case the order is awarded, the proof of completion certificate will be submitted. The applicant should submit the proof towards the receipt of full fees from their clients, in case they could not submit completion certificate for any task completed by them.  In case of non-disclosure agreement, self-certified declaration from MD/Competent Authority may be submitted. However, in case of selection proof of the relevant document shall be provided. |  |
| 4)   | Appendix 1 – 2.1  | Details of full time Equivalent (FTE) professional as per para 7.2.1 (Project value more than Rs 250 Crs)-Min 20 FTE  | We request you to clarify if every FTE is expected to have worked on a similar engagement of Rs. 250 crores. Please clarify how we need   | Please refer Addendum-I   |  |

|     |   |   | to ascertain this criteria.  |   |
|-----|---|---|--|---|
|     |   |   |  |   |
| IV. | Name of Firm: M/s SPA CAPITAL AD  | WISORS I TD   |  |   |
| 1)  | Page 3 first Para   | In the first Para at page 3 it is mentioned that, Indian Ports Association has been assigned by Ministry of Shipping, Government of India with the task of preparation of panel of consultants (Financial Advisors). Accordingly, Indian Ports Association invites Requests for Qualification (RFQ) for empanelment of consultants (Financial Advisor) for evaluation of Project initiatives in Port Sector/SEZs, MMLPs.  | (Financial Advisors) empanelled un<br>the RFQ will deemed to be  | IPA will be empanelling the FAs and the respective Ports/ IPA/ Ministry will be a availing their services of through their own process by inviting RFP from empanelled agencies |
| 2)  | As per Clause 2 at page 4, under Brief Scope of Financial Advisor for PPP Project | As per Clause 2 at page 4, under <b>Brief</b> Scope of Financial Advisor for PPP Project Financial Appraisal and Advisory Services for bankable project development, would inter-alia, include: Evaluation of project plans from project formulation stage for bankability of the project. Assistance in preparation of project feasibility study and bankable detailed project reports.  Assistance in formulation of optimal project implementation structure. Assistance in optimal allocation of risk, investments, operational and | Advisor may be required to raise the required Funds in the projects and may also be required to commit any minimum amount or separate Bids will called by the Individual Ports  2. PPP Projects: Please clarify the definition of the PPP projects. If the following types of projects will be considered  a. where in project given to Private land was given by Govt as part of its contribution but when it was | The role of FA has already been prescribed in Clause 2 and no further clarification is felt necessary.  |

|    |                        | financing responsibilities among           | and completed the same               |                                 |
|----|------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
|    |                        | stakeholders.                              |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | · Assistance in project formulation /      | b. Where the projects are given      |                                 |
|    |                        | cash flow projections and undertaking      | L                                    |                                 |
|    |                        | financial appraisal of project.            | up the power projects and Govt       |                                 |
|    |                        | · Transaction Advisory- Pre-Bid/ Post      |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | Bid including assistance in preparation    | them at certain predefined rates.    |                                 |
|    |                        | of Bid Document, assistance in             |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | preparation of optimal bidding             |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | parameters, assistance in formulizing      | 1                                    |                                 |
|    |                        | optimal bidding/ project award             |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | structure                                  | resultant credit rating and the      |                                 |
|    |                        |  | project has to be developed under    |                                 |
|    |                        |  | PPP model. Such projects will be     |                                 |
|    |                        |  | covered under PPP model              |                                 |
|    |                        |  | d. In case where the projects (Road  |                                 |
|    |                        |  | Projects) were developed by Pvt      |                                 |
|    |                        |  | Sector and later transferred to      |                                 |
|    |                        |  | Annuity Model                        |                                 |
| 3) | Page 5                 | As per note under clause 3 Para two at     |                                      | Needs no further clarification. |
|    | Clause 3 Para two      | page 5 under <b>Objects</b> , "The advisor | and Experts means Technical and      |                                 |
|    |                        | can engage external advisors,              | 1                                    |                                 |
|    |                        | consultants and experts with the prior     | Support etc who may be appointed     |                                 |
|    |                        | written approval of IPA/MoS/Ports"         | later at the time of Bids by         |                                 |
|    |                        |  | Individual Port with their           |                                 |
|    |                        |  | permission or they should form part  |                                 |
|    |                        |  | of the Bidder's Team to be           |                                 |
| -  |                        |  | mentioned at the time of this Bid    |                                 |
| 4) | Page 6                 | As per clause 6.2 at page 6 under          |                                      | Tender conditions prevail.      |
|    | Clause 6.2             | qualification Criteria for                 |                                      |                                 |
|    | Qualification Criteria | Empanelment of Consultant                  | considered for Qualification and for |                                 |
|    |                        | Financial Advisor, 'Experience of          |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | having successfully completed similar      | recent RFQ by Ministry of Urban      |                                 |
|    |                        | works during last 7 years, ending last     |                                      |                                 |
|    |                        | day of the month previous to the one in    | done by bidders were considered      |                                 |

|    |                        | which applications are invited should   | not limiting to a few years only.      |                                     |
|----|------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------------|
|    |                        | be either of following'                 | 2. Here, please clarify the projects   |                                     |
|    |                        |   | of last seven years are considered     |                                     |
|    |                        |   | for considering points and not pre-    |                                     |
|    |                        |   | qualification purpose i.e. it is not   |                                     |
|    |                        |   | necessary that the company should      |                                     |
|    |                        |   | have 7 years experience in PPP         |                                     |
|    |                        |   | Infra Projects. Please also confirm    |                                     |
|    |                        |   | that the Bidders should have           |                                     |
|    |                        |   | minimum three years experience as      |                                     |
|    |                        |   | mentioned at the last Para of page 6   |                                     |
|    |                        |   | under "Similar Work" and not           |                                     |
|    |                        |   | seven years as mentioned above         |                                     |
| 5) | Page 6                 | As per note under clause 6 in last Para | 1. The Projects may be under PPP       | This needs no further clarification |
|    | Clause 6 in last Para  | at page 6 under Qualification Criteria  | or a combination e.g. PPP, Sole of     |                                     |
|    | Qualification Criteria | for Empanelment of Consultant,          | Govt or solely of Pvt Party both for   |                                     |
|    |                        | Similar Works is defined as: "The       | qualification criterion and for        |                                     |
|    |                        | Tenderer should have experience of      | computing total experience for total   |                                     |
|    |                        | providing Financial Advisory Services   | points                                 |                                     |
|    |                        | i.e. providing qualified Legal,         |  |                                     |
|    |                        | Financial & Technical Experts with a    |  |                                     |
|    |                        | minimum three years carrying out PPP    | Gazette Notifications dated October    |                                     |
|    |                        | Transactions in any infrastructure      | 13, 2014, April 8, 2016 and August     |                                     |
|    |                        | Projects."                              | 1, 2016 issued by the Department of    |                                     |
|    |                        |   | Economic Affairs, Ministry of          |                                     |
|    |                        |   | Finance, Govt of India or any other    |                                     |
|    |                        |   | guidelines/rules                       |                                     |
|    |                        |   | 2. Plance also also the continue       |                                     |
|    |                        |   | 3. Please also clarify the projects un |                                     |
|    |                        |   | EWS Housing will be covered            |                                     |
|    |                        |   | under Infrastructure Projects.         |                                     |
|    |                        |   | 4. Does the Technical Experts          |                                     |
|    |                        |   | means to include Architects,           |                                     |
|    |                        | <u> </u>                                | means to metude Architects,            |                                     |

| mit the case the proof of will be nt should vards the could not ficate for |
|--|
| case the proof of will be nt should vards the room their could not         |
| case the proof of will be nt should vards the room their could not         |
| case the proof of will be nt should vards the room their could not         |
| case the proof of will be nt should vards the room their could not         |
| proof of will be nt should vards the rom their could not                   |
| will be nt should vards the rom their could not                            |
| nt should<br>vards the<br>rom their<br>could not                           |
| ards the com their could not   |
| rom their<br>could not   |
| could not  |
|  |
| ficate for   |
|  |
| em.  |
| [  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| P stage at   |
|  |
| proposed   |
| el details   |
| which  |
| S method   |
| nancial  |
| project.   |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| I  |
| I  |
| I  |
| ]<br>]<br>,<br>3   |

|     |   | · Financial Bid - 30 points   |   |                                      |
|-----|---|---|---|--------------------------------------|
| 9)  | Page 7 Evaluation Criteria  | As per clause 7.1 page 7 under evaluation Criteria, The applicant should provide details of completed assignments in the last 07 years to demonstrate experience in providing the consultancy service.  | It is requested that the Condition of 7 Years may be extended to ten years to cover Bidders having more experience  | Tender condition prevails.           |
| 10) | Page 8 Clause 8.10 General Conditions mentions  | As per clause 8.10 Page 8 under General Conditions mentions: "When two or more firms are forming a consortium to participate in RFQ than one firm shall become the lead member of the consortium)   | firms can be consortium Partners<br>three or more and there should be<br>some technical Partner or Team to  | No further clarification is required |
| 11) | Page 18 Clause 4 Schedule-3 of 'Guidance Note on Conflict of Interest':                       | As per clause 4 at Page 18 under Schedule-3 of 'Guidance Note on Conflict of Interest': The normal way to identify conflicts of interest is through self-declaration by Financial Advisors. Where a conflict exists, which has not been declared, competing companies are likely to bring this to the notice of the Major Ports/IPA. All conflicts must be declared as and when the Financial Advisors become aware of them | Merchant Banker/Arranger for raising the large debts. If at any further stage Bidders are required to shortlist the Arrangers of Funds Raising for the Projects of the Individual Ports, there may arise Conflict of Interest. Please clarify should we declare the same at the | No further clarification is required |
| 12) | Page 20<br>Appendix-I Clause 2.1 under "Details of<br>full time Equivalent (FTE) professional |   | 1. Please clarify 'Min 20 FTE' means minimum 20 Full Time Professionals employed in relevant  | Please refer Addendum-I              |

|     | as per Clause 7.2.1 (Project value more | professional as per Clause 7.2.1      | activities and how "Project value     |                                      |
|-----|---|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
|     | than Rs 250 Crs)- Min 20 FTE            | (Project value more than Rs 250 Crs)- | more than Rs 250 Cr" means to         |                                      |
|     |   | Min 20 FTE                            | relate with the FTE                   |                                      |
|     |   | 1/1111 20 1 12                        | Teluce William and TiE                |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | 2. Please also clarify the            |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | Organizational Chart motioned here    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | is to given for the whole company     |                                      |
|     |   |                                       |                                       |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | or the Team handling the              |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | assignment as Financial Advisors to   |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | be proposed in the present RFQ        |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | 3. Pease also clarify If Team Lead    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | working on the other projects may     |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | be common now or a exclusively        |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | dedicated team is required.           |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | •                                     |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | 4. Please also clarify if the team is |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | required to onsite or Offsite         |                                      |
| 13) | Appendix-I Clause 2.2 Key Personnel     | Appendix-I Clause 2.2 Key Personnel   | 1. Please clarify if a Key            | The RFP document indicates the       |
|     | page 20 under                           | page 20 under                         | professional has common               | services required from FA. It is for |
|     | Legal key Personnel                     | Legal key Personnel                   | qualification of Finance and legal    | the FA to offer the persons with     |
|     |   |                                       | (CA, LLB) it will be considered in    | requisite expertise.                 |
|     |   |                                       | both the categories and the points    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | will be allocated under both          |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | Finance & Legal                       |                                      |
|     |   |                                       |                                       |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | 2. Please clarify whether a Legal     |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | Expert can be appointed by a bidder   |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | as a consultant and not as a          |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | Consortium Member?                    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       |                                       |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | 3. If working as Consultant, the      |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | experience of the legal consultant    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | will be considered for arriving at    |                                      |
|     |   |                                       | the points scored by Legal Key        |                                      |
|     |   |                                       |                                       |                                      |

| Professional  4. Technical Consultant: At many places of RFQ the Technical Person word is used (Clause 4 page 5 Broad under Roles; clause 6 in last Para at page 6 under Qualification Criterion, clause 8.9 page 8 of General Conditions etc) but there is no mention of criterion of the Technical Person except that of Finance and Legal. Please clarify |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
| evaluation under the present RFQ   |  |

| V. | Name of Firm: M/s A | <mark>Almondz</mark> |       |       |  |                                    |                            |
|----|---------------------|----------------------|-------|-------|--|------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1) | General Condition;  | Clause               | No.   | 8.5,  | The applicant has to submit along with | We request the authority to kindly | Tender conditions prevail. |
|    | Page No. 8          |                      |       |       | the bid document Rs.10,000/- as non-   | delete the text "irrespective of   |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | refundable application fee, which will | number of disciplines quoted."     |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | be valid for 3-years irrespective of   |                                    |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | number of disciplines quoted.          |                                    |                            |
| 2) | General Condition;  | Clause               | No. 8 | 3.18, | The Major Ports as and when required   |                                    | Tender condition prevails  |
|    | Page No. 11         |                      |       |       | will obtain financial offers from the  | consider :                         |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | empanelled Financial Advisors along    |                                    |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | with key personnel required            | Key personnel - 80 points          |                            |
|    |                     |                      |       |       | specifically for the project from the  | They personner to points           |                            |

|    |                                | Consultants evaluated as below:       | Financial Bid - 20 points.         |                                   |
|----|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
|    |                                |                                       |                                    |                                   |
|    |                                | Key personnel - 70 points             |                                    |                                   |
|    |                                | Financial Bid - 30 points.            |                                    |                                   |
| 3) | Appendix – I; 2.1, Page No. 20 | Details of full time Equivalent (FTE) | We request the authority to kindly | Tender condition prevails         |
|    |                                | professional as per para 7.2.1        | delete:                            |                                   |
|    |                                | (Project value more than Rs 250 Crs)- |                                    |                                   |
|    |                                | Min 20 FTE                            | Project value more than Rs 250 Cr. |                                   |
| 4) |                                | The requisite document fee of Rs.     | We had submitted the document fee  | This is new empanelment.          |
|    |                                | 10,000/- in the form of Demand Draft  | of Rs. 10,000/- for Empanelment of | _                                 |
|    |                                | drawn in favour of Indian Ports       | Transaction Advisor for Major      | Therefore, Firm will have to      |
|    |                                | Association shall be submitted along  | Ports, May, 2016, which was        | submit the document fee of Rs     |
|    |                                | with bid.                             | subsequently annulled.             | 10,000 for this empanelment along |
|    |                                |                                       |                                    | with bid.                         |
|    |                                |                                       | We request the authority to kindly |                                   |
|    |                                |                                       | adjust our document fee of Rs.     |                                   |
|    |                                |                                       | 10,000/- with this Empanelment.    |                                   |

| VI. | Name of Firm: M/s P A R Y & Co., Cha  | artered Accountants   |  |   |
|-----|---|---|--|---|
| 1)  | Clause No.2 Brief Scope of Financial Advisor for PPP projects. Financial          | Assistance in preparation of project feasibility study and bankable detailed project reports.   | As per our understanding the Financial Advisors are only assisting in incorporating/ fine tuning of financial figures as appear in bankable detailed project reports (DPR) and they are not supposed to prepare the same, as the same is covered in the scope of work of Technical consultants to the Project. Please clarify. | The conditions as given in the clause is clear.   |
| 2)  | Clause No.2<br>Brief Scope of Financial Advisor for<br>PPP projects.<br>Financial | Transaction Advisory- Pre-Bid/ Post Bid including assistance in preparation of Bid Document, assistance in preparation of optimal bidding parameters, assistance in formulising optimal bidding/ project award structure.   | Whether there is any "Standard   | No. The bidding documents will be developed depending upon the nature of requirements.                                    |
| 3)  | Clause No.3<br>Objective  | Financial Advisor shall be engaged and work closely with IPA, Ministry of Shipping, Govt. of India, port authorities, prospective bidders, port users, potential project investors and various other project stakeholders. The Advisor shall engage with IPA/MoS from project formulation stage till award of project to project developer. | You are requested to clarify that Financial Advisors are engaged by IPA/MoS/Port Authorities/Any one of these authorities. Further, also ensure that the reporting will be to single authority only and payment will also be made by the same authority, who will engage Financial Consultant.                                 | The respective authorities will be the nodal agency.  |
| 4)  | Clause No.4 Broad Role of Consultants   | Financial Advisor shall be required to provide services in <b>Technica</b> l, Financial & Legal matters for PPP Projects of all Major Ports.  | •  | Financial Advisor shall be required to provide services in Financial & Legal matters for PPP Projects of all Major Ports. |

|    |  |  | CA and Legal experts as Key Personnel.  |  |
|----|--|--|---|--|
| 5) | Clause No.4<br>Broad Role of Consultants   | In short, they shall be instrumental in conceptualization of the PPP project till <b>implementation</b> .  | You are requested to define the word "Implementation", as per our understanding the financial advisors are supposed to provide their services till Financial Closure stage. Please clarify. | In short, they shall be instrumental in conceptualization of the PPP project till <b>Financial closure</b> . |
|    |  |  | Further, if the authority is agreed with our view, then the word "Implementation" should replace with "Financial Closure"   |  |
| 6) | Clause No.5(c) Entering into Agreement   | On selection of the Financial Advisor, the concerned Major Port Trust will enter into agreement in the form prescribed by them.  | draft copy of the proposed  | Agreement will be signed with mutual consent.  |
| 7) | Clause No.6 Qualification Criteria for Empanelment of Consultant-Financial Advisor | Similar Works: The Tenderer should have experience of providing Financial Advisory Services i.e. providing qualified Legal, Financial & Technical Experts with a minimum three years carrying out PPP Transactions in any infrastructure Projects. | Consultants are supposed to provide   | The clause is clear.   |

|     |  |  | this clause is not synchronize with the requirement of Key Personnel as per Appendix-A to RFQ document, where you required only CA and Legal experts as Key Personnel. Therefore, you are requested to remove the word "Technical Expert" from this clause. |   |
|-----|--|--|---|---|
| 8)  | Clause No.6 Qualification Criteria for Empanelment of Consultant-Financial Advisor | Similar Works: The Tenderer should have experience of providing Financial Advisory Services i.e. providing qualified Legal, Financial & Technical Experts with a minimum three years carrying out PPP Transactions in any infrastructure Projects. | infrastructure Projects includes<br>Road, Highway, Power sector   | No further clarification required.  |
| 9)  | Clause No.7<br>Evaluation Criteria   | Experience (40 Points )<br>Human Resources (Total : 30 Points)   | You are requested to mention the minimum Points required to qualify for empanelment as Financial Advisor.   | Pl refer Addendum-I   |
| 10) | Clause No.8.9<br>General Conditions  | The applicant should have regular set up of a team of Persons having sufficient experience in <b>Technical</b> , Financial & Legal as per requirement of PPP Projects.   | word " <b>Technical</b> " from this clause, in view of the reason explained   | The applicant should have regular set up of a team of Persons having sufficient experience in Financial & Legal as per requirement of PPP Projects. |
| 11) | Clause No.8.12<br>General Conditions   | It may be noted that after empanelment, works shall be allotted to various Financial Advisors commensurate to their capabilities and capacities as assessed by IPA/Major Port. No representation in this respect will be entertained.              | Please clarify the provisions of this clause, as there is ambiguity w.r.t. criteria to judge the <b>capabilities and capacities</b> by IPA/Major Ports after this empanelment.  It seems that it is a duplicity of  | Tender conditions prevail.  |

|     |  |  | work at two levels, as per our opinion the capabilities and capacities of financial consultants has already been ascertained through this RFQ document.  Ascertaining the same by IPA/Major Ports will delay in achieving its objectives. Therefore, you are requested to reconsider this clause and make the process more transparent and smooth.  To make the process fast, it would be advisable to empanel the Financial Advisor at some fix amount of fees and allot the projects as per the roaster maintained by IPA. |   |
|-----|--|--|--|---|
| 12) | Clause No.8.14<br>General Conditions       | Applicant has to furnish following undertaking along with bid:   | Please clarify that the same has to be given on Stamp Paper or letter head of the Applicant?   | The same has to be given on letter head of the applicant. |
| 13) | Clause No.8.15 Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) | No tender will be considered which is not accompanied by a sum of Rs. 2, 50,000 (Rupees Two Lakhs Fifty Thousand only) as Earnest Money Deposit. | You are requested to exempt this EMD for the MSME registered entities in view of Public Procurement Policy for Micro and Small Enterprise (MSME) order 2012, issued vide Gazette Notification number 503, dated 23.03.2012 by Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise of Govt. of India, shall be exempted from Processing Fees, bid bond   | Tender condition prevails.                                |

|     |  |   | submission, EMD, etc. on production of valid registration certificate duly issued by Ministry of Micro, Small & Medium Entrepreneurs through: District Industries Centre (DIC); or National Small Industries Corporation (NSIC).   |   |
|-----|--|---|--|---|
| 14) | Clause No.8.18<br>Evaluation Processes | The Major Ports as and when required will obtain financial offers from the empanelled Financial Advisors along with key personnel required specifically for the project from the Consultants. | bid/offer. Please clarify.   | No financial Offer is required.   |
| 15) | Clause No.2.1<br>Appendix-I            | For 20 FTE – 10 Points<br>More than 20 FTE -10 Points   | Please clarify that how the same 10 points have been allocated for 20 FTE as well as for more than 20 FTE?   | Please refer Addendum-I   |
| 16) | Miscellaneous                          | Format for pre-qualification/ Technical & Financial   | There is no format available along with this RFQ document, in which financial consultants has to provide the information to IPA for the purpose of evaluation of capabilities and capacity of financial consultants as per the Qualification Criteria given for their empanelment. | Please refer Addendum-I for Technical offer and No Financial offer is required to submit for empanelment. |

| VII | Name of Firm: M/s Fortress          |  |                                      |                                     |
|-----|-------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1)  | Clause 6 Stage 1:                   | Similar Works:                           | We understand this clause as under   | The clause is clear. Tender         |
|     | Qualification Criteria for          | The Tenderer should have experience      | : The tenderer should have           | conditions prevail.                 |
|     | Empanelment of Consultant-Financial |  | experience of minimum 3 years for    |                                     |
|     | Advisor (Pg.6)                      | Services i.e. providing qualified Legal, | providing Financial Advisory         |                                     |
|     |                                     | Financial & Technical Experts with a     | Services i.e. Financial, Technical & |                                     |
|     |                                     | minimum three years carrying out PPP     | Legal services for PPP Transactions  |                                     |
|     |                                     | Transactions in any infrastructure       | in any infrastructure projects.      |                                     |
|     |                                     | Projects.                                | Kindly confirm.                      |                                     |
| 2)  | Clause 7.0 : Evaluation Criteria    | Clause 7.0 : Evaluation Criteria         | Kindly inform about the              | Please refer Addendum-I             |
|     | (Pg.7): Minimum Qualifying Score    | (Pg.7): Minimum Qualifying Score         | requirement of minimum score to      |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | qualify for empanelment.             |                                     |
| 3)  | Clause 8.15 - Earnest Money Deposit | An EMD of Rs. 2,50,000/- (Rupee          | This is just an empanelment of       | Tender Condition prevails.          |
|     | ( <b>Pg.9</b> )                     | Two Lakhs fifty Thousand only), in       | consultant and not the award of      |                                     |
|     |                                     | the form of Demand Draft(DD) drawn       | project. As a standard practice of   |                                     |
|     |                                     | in favour of Indian Ports Association,   | tendering followed by many           |                                     |
|     |                                     | payable at New Delhi EMD of              | government authorities as well       |                                     |
|     |                                     | successful bidders/empanelled bidders    | various ministries of Government of  |                                     |
|     |                                     | will be retained for entire period of    | India/ State Government, there is no |                                     |
|     |                                     | empanelment i.e. 3 years or such         | S                                    |                                     |
|     |                                     | extended period by IPA.                  | empanelment.                         |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | However we hereby request you to     |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | waive off the EMD amount while       |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | submitting our proposal and it can   |                                     |
| 45  |                                     | T 17 D 1 C 1                             | be charged at the time of RFP stage. |                                     |
| 4)  | Appendix-I : Sr. No. 2.2 : Key      |  | As per Appendix- I, it is not clear  | This clause is included to          |
|     | Personnel (Pg.20)                   | (For one -3 and for two and above $-5$ ) | whether the legal expert should be   | demonstrate that the Applicant      |
|     |                                     |  | FTE or can be associated as per the  | possess necessary expertise in      |
|     |                                     |  | requirement of project. As a         | providing the legal assistance.     |
|     |                                     |  | common practice, Legal experts are   | Hence, the Applicant is required to |
|     |                                     |  | hired as per requirement and need    | comply with this clause             |
|     |                                     |  | of project from time to time.        |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | However we request you to allow      |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | the services of legal expert as per  |                                     |
|     |                                     |  | requirement of project and can be    |                                     |

|      |                                      |  | hired at that time only.  |  |
|------|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| VIII | Name of Firm: IIFCL Projects Limited | İ  |   |  |
| 1)   | Page – 6 Qualification Criteria      | Similar Works: The Tenderer should have experience of providing Financial Advisory Services i.e. providing qualified Legal, Financial & Technical Experts with a minimum three years carrying out PPP Transactions in any infrastructure Projects. | infrastructure requires a very strong   | No change is warranted. Tender conditions prevail. |
| 2)   | Page – 8 Point 8.8 Annexure – 4      | For applicants who are subsidiaries of foreign companies (Equity of Foreign entity more than 50%) and if their turnover are claimed, the IPA/Major Port shall insist for a letter from the Parent Company to make their services                   | financial institution".  In order to be able to provide the best team for assignment and to be able to provide multi-disciplinary advice to IPA/ Port Trusts, we suggest that applicants be allowed to showcase the terms in terms of | No change is warranted, Tender conditions prevail. |

|     |                                     | available to Indian Company as required and demanded by IPA/Major Port without any extra financial | companies (Indian or Foreign Entity). Hence, we request you to                                      |  |
|-----|-------------------------------------|--|---|--|
|     |                                     | liabilities.   | kindly modify the referred clause as follows.   |  |
|     |                                     |  | For applicants who are subsidiaries of Foreign/ Indian companies (Equity of Parent entity more than |  |
|     |                                     |  | 50%) and if their turnover/   |  |
|     |                                     |  | expertise are claimed, the IPA/Major Port shall insist for a  |  |
|     |                                     |  | letter from the Parent/ Group   |  |
|     |                                     |  | Company to make their services  |  |
|     |                                     |  | available to applicant as required and demanded by IPA/Major Port                                   |  |
|     |                                     |  | without any extra financial   |  |
|     |                                     |  | liabilities.  |  |
| 3)  | General Query                       |  | Since we are already empanelled with IPA and EMD for which has                                      | This is new empanelment.  Therefore, Firm will have to |
|     |                                     |  | been submitted to the organisation.   | submit the document fee & EMD                          |
|     |                                     |  | Do we need to get ourself   | for this empanelment along with                        |
|     |                                     |  | empaneled again and submit the  | bid.   |
|     |                                     |  | EMD for the above mentioned   |  |
| IX. | Name of Firm: M/s aXYKno Capital So | ervices Pyt. Ltd.  | project.  |  |
| 1)  | Clause No. 8.15                     | Tender will be considered which is not   | If company is registered under  | Tender condition prevails.                             |
|     | Earnest Money Deposit               | accompanied by sum of Rs. 2,50,000/-   | MSME, while making application  | _  |
|     |                                     | as EMD.  | for Government Tender, bidder is  |  |
|     |                                     |  | exempted from Tender Cost, EMD & Security Deposit.  |  |
|     |                                     |  | Online of above please give   |  |
|     |                                     |  | exemption from tender cost and  |  |
|     |                                     |  | EMD for those bidders who have  |  |
|     |                                     |  | MSME Registration Certificate. Or   |  |

|  | Allow the Earnest Money of        |  |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|
|  | Rs.2,50,000/- in the form of Bank |  |
|  | Guarantee.                        |  |